Journal of Optical Communications and Networking (JOCN)
Review Criteria for Research Articles
version: 4 October 2022

The *Journal of Optical Communications and Networking* (JOCN) is an archival-type journal that publishes peer-reviewed articles related to advances in the state-of-the-art of optical networking science, technology, and engineering. The journal scope encompasses both theoretical contributions (including new techniques, concepts, analyses, and economic studies) and practical contributions (including optical networking experiments, prototypes, and new applications). JOCN considers original research articles, letters, invited reviews, tutorials, and comments on published articles.

To meet JOCN's goal of publishing high-impact research, submitted papers are subjected to critical review according to the criteria listed below.

Quality of Scientific/Technical Content
Does the manuscript report on substantial findings related to optical networking issues such as design, operations, performance or technology? Is the paper an original and significant contribution to the field? Are the conclusions supported by the data presented, and is the work placed in proper context? Is prior or related work adequately referenced? Note that papers considered to be incremental, incomplete, or lacking in scientific/technical relevance are likely to be rejected. Does the work warrant publication in an archival journal? Is it likely to be cited by others?
Rating Options: Very high, High, Moderate, Low, Very low

Quality of Presentation
Is the title accurate and does it clearly identify the subject matter? Is the abstract succinct and comprehensible to a non-specialist? Is the manuscript clearly written and logically organized? Are figures and tables understandable and readable as submitted, including all captions and labels? Is the quality of English language usage and grammar appropriate for an archival journal?
Rating Options: Very high, High, Moderate, Low, Very low

Appropriateness for JOCN
Does the subject material fall within the scope of the Journal? Will the paper be of interest to the optical networking community?
Rating Options: Very high, High, Moderate, Low, Very low

Overall Impact
Reviewers are asked to rate the overall impact of submitted papers assuming appropriate revisions are made. How likely is this paper to make a major impact on the research field covered? Papers with a major impact are expected to be highly cited. Research articles can make an impact through novel results, through enabling new applications, by solving important problems, by providing new theoretical insights, or presenting clear methods, procedures, or reviews to help other researchers perform similar work.
Rating Options: Very high, High, Moderate, Low, Very low

Appropriateness of Supplementary Material
Visualizations (videos, 2D images, 3D images), tabular data, or citations to datasets in external repositories should be integral to understanding the article and support the results reported. Custom code and design files are acceptable to include as additional information, which is helpful to readers.
• Is the supplementary material openly accessible, understandable, and readable?
• Does the supplementary material contribute to presentation of the results?
Rating Options: High, Moderate, Low, Not Applicable